THEOLOGICAL Studies

Book Reviews

Theological Studies
2020, Vol. 81(3) 741–766

DOI: 10.1177/0040563920963329
journals.sagepub.com/home/tsj
SAGE

Tora und Fest: Aufsätze zum Deuteronomium und zur Liturgie. By Georg Braulik, OSB. Stuttgarter Biblische Aufsatzbände 69. Stuttgart: Katholisches Bibelwerk, 2019. Pp. 373. $53.94.

The essays assembled in this volume represent the twin emphases of Georg Braulik's scholarly career: Deuteronomy and Christian liturgy. The first essay, "Eine Gesellschaft ohne Arme," highlights distinctive aspects of the social legislation found in Deuteronomy; having intervened concretely for the oppressed in the events of the Exodus, Israel's God instituted a social order that abolished the conditions (especially those of ever-mounting indebtedness) leading to permanent slavery. God also stipulated provisions on behalf of the "stranger, the orphan and the widow," thus ensuring their sustenance and full participation in religious feasts. B. gestures towards interesting questions that Deuteronomy may still pose to us—for instance, is "scarcity" the true starting point for economic reasoning, or might community, justice, and divine *blessing* be truer to reality (29–30)? The second essay, "Lohnverweigerung und Sippenhaftung," takes up Deuteronomy's curious juxtaposition of a rule concerning the payment of wages (24:14–15) with a prohibition of clan liability (24:16), arguing that such legislation ultimately aims at the construction of a "brotherly" community that overcomes poverty. The chapter "'Heute' im Buch Deuteronomium" examines the rhetorical and theological purposes of Deuteronomy's characteristic emphasis on "today." Special significance is attached to Deut. 29:14 (29:15 in English translations), which invites future readers so to identify with Moses and his initial hearers that they—in their own "today"—choose covenant faithfulness and the consequent "life" held out within the text. The fourth essay, "Das Ende einer Karriere? Zum Dekalog in Deuteronomium 5 nach der revidierten Einheitsübersetzung," argues that the 2016 revision of the German *Einheitsübersetzung* obscures the connections—present in the original Hebrew—between the Decalogue in Deuteronomy 5 and the subsequent chapters. Though the essay is aimed at readers of the German Bible, B.'s observations about the structural role of the Decalogue will be of general interest. In "Alltägliche Ernährung und festliches Mahl im Buch Deuteronomium," B. examines the significance of food in Deuteronomy. Lexical combinations of "eat" with other terms (e.g., "drink,"

"be satisfied," "rejoice," etc.) are surveyed, and usages associated with a liturgical context are given special attention. B. concludes with brief but stimulating reflections on the Lukan appropriation of the Deuteronomic language of "eating and rejoicing" in the story of the Prodigal Son (Luke 15:23). The last, previously unpublished essay on Deuteronomy, "Hat Gott die Religionen der Völker gestiftet?," offers a thorough exegesis of the terms for "God/gods" found in Deut. 4:1–40, arguing that the passage enjoins an exclusive monotheism—one influenced by and in agreement with Deutero-Isaiah.

Constructive theological proposals in the chapters on Deuteronomy are sparing, but this changes considerably with the essays on Christian liturgy. In "Verweigert die Westkirche den Heiligen des Alten Testaments die liturgische Verehrung?" B. remarks on the relative lack of integration of Old Testament figures into the Latin Church's calendar of saints, pointing out that even the nominal place held by them (e.g., by the Maccabean martyrs) has been effectively erased by post-conciliar changes to the liturgical rubrics. B. argues theologically for a revival of veneration of Old Testament saints. In "Die Erneuerung der Liturgie und das Alte Testament an den Beispielen Pascha-Mysterium und Tora" B. urges that the paschal mystery of Christ should not be reduced to Christ's death on the cross; rather, it ought to be understood as including the Pascha of Israel. The Torah should be appreciated as a concrete representation of salvation and as a constitutive part of *Christian* Scripture; thus, a defective understanding of the covenant needs to be corrected in the fourth Eucharistic prayer, and a Torah lesson ought to be reintroduced liturgically (as per East Syrian church precedent). In "Maria als Inbild Israels" B. examines a liturgical interweaving of psalms with antiphons drawn from Luke's Annunciation scene. B. finds a rich and liturgically expressed sensitivity to the dynamics of the Magnificat, where Mary speaks as a figuration of her people Israel, and so also of the church. The final essay, "Du bist doch unser Vater! 'Unser Erlöser von jeher' ist dein Name," notes that the Old Testament assumes the social constitution of individuals, and thus gives sustained attention to collective guilt and to the possibility of forgiveness for the same. B. explores the theology of lament and of petition for communal forgiveness expressed in Isaiah 63:7–64:11, urging that such lament and petition have become too infrequent in modern liturgy.

The exegetical essays gathered here certainly contain theologically suggestive observations, such as those concerning the social vision of Pentateuchal legislation or the deeply Deuteronomic resonances of a phrase chosen by the evangelist Luke. Whether these rewards are sufficient to repay reading through the dense technical exegesis will depend on the interests of the reader. For the theologically interested, the essays on liturgy are surely the most rewarding aspect of the collection—both for their theological constructiveness and for their appropriation of the Old Testament as a resource for liturgical reflection.

Stephen A. Long
Providence College, Providence, RI

The End of the Beginning: Joshua and Judges. Volume 1 of A People and a Land. By Johanna W. H. van Wijk-Bos. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2019. Pp. xiv + 351. $29.99.

The books of Joshua and Judges pose a serious challenge to modern theological sensibilities. Violence is plentiful in these books, much of it divinely sanctioned, and even when that is not the case we are left with the problem of divine silence in the face of horrific bloodshed. This commentary by Joanna W. H. van Wijk-Bos, professor of Old Testament at Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary, engages this challenge with two goals in mind: first, to draw readers into a close reading of Joshua and Judges, and second, to reveal the multiplicity of voices that comprise the books. By attending to these voices and the tensions among them, W.-B. invites readers "to enter into the text with our questions and, in our very questioning, tentatively find a way forward, drawing closer to the presence of the Most Holy" (xiii). W.-B. meets these goals by situating Joshua and Judges in their various ancient contexts, attending to their literary features, and occasionally offering strategies for modern readers to make meaning of their content.

The commentary's introduction offers a valuable overview of the ancient backgrounds of Joshua and Judges. Acknowledging the presence of older sources within the books, W.-B. emphasizes the post-exilic setting of their final composition and argues that their historiography serves as identity formation for a traumatized people. In this discussion W.-B. not only illuminates the aims of the books' authors/editors but also draws compelling parallels to more recent examples of displaced peoples and national catastrophes, including her own experience growing up in the Netherlands after the Second World War. Other key topics covered in the introduction include land, peoplehood, gender, heroes, and remembrance.

The rest of the commentary divides Joshua and Judges into Acts and Scenes, with occasional excerpts of biblical text and with an epigraph (or two) from various scholars at the beginning of each section. The arrangement is user-friendly, the excerpts are well chosen, and the epigraphs mirror the multivocality that W.-B. highlights in Joshua and Judges. Indeed, her attention to the diversity of voices in the text is one of the strongest features of this commentary. With numerous examples, W.-B. shows that the tensions created by this diversity are integral to the biblical narrative. Just as the editors of Joshua and Judges let these tensions stand rather than harmonize them, we are invited to hold their various perspectives in tension as well.

Another strength of this commentary is W.-B.'s skill at teasing out subtleties of the biblical narrative. Not presuming readers' knowledge of Hebrew, she explicates nuances of key words, draws connections to parallel language in related biblical texts, and even draws our attention to syntactic details and their effect on a story. W.-B. is also strong at highlighting depictions of women in Joshua and Judges and feminist interpretation of these characters. Major figures, such as Rahab and Deborah, get the attention they deserve, as so do lesser-known characters, like the daughters of Zelofhad (Josh 17:3–4) and Achsa (Judg 1:13–15).

The most significant weakness of this commentary is its dearth of theological discussion. W.-B. mentions YHWH's action in the narrative and offers some reflections, but they are too few for a commentary whose goal is to get readers "to enter

into the text with our questions." Sometimes W.-B. sidesteps thorny theological problems with historical explanations. For example, she tries to soften the horror of *ḥērem* warfare (the devotion-through-destruction of captives and spoils of war as an offering to YHWH) by arguing that in its ancient setting "the practice exhibits a certain respect for the other party" and that "to leave no survivors . . . may not have been the worst fate to inflict" (46–47). Such an explanation does little to address the theological and ethical difficulty of *ḥērem* for readers today. A much richer reflection follows the story of Deborah; here W.-B. combines exegesis, personal memoir, theology, and feminist criticism to give readers a well-rounded view of the text.

This commentary will make you a more careful and perceptive reader of Joshua and Judges. It is highly recommended for anyone seeking a deeper and multifaceted engagement with these books.

Andrew R. Davis
Boston College

Catholic Modern: The Challenge of Totalitarianism and the Remaking of the Church. By James Chappel. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2018. Pp. 342. $36.

Broadly construed, reflection and debate over the relationship between the church and modernity was one of the defining features of 20th-century Catholicism, culminating but certainly not ending with the Second Vatican Council. This trajectory had a number of facets—theological, philosophical, political—all of which have been explored by a growing literature on the period. James Chappel's *Catholic Modern* represents a key contribution to understanding the relationship between Catholicism and political modernity as experienced particularly in the decades before and immediately after the Second World War.

Given the time period in question, C. focuses significant attention on the Catholic relationship to fascism and communism. Notably, he remarks that "The two forms of Catholic modernism . . . were not fascist and Communist but *antifascist* and *anti-Communist*" (13). This distinction, developed in the introduction, sets the tone for the work by articulating how Catholics navigated the civilizational challenges of the era. He further elaborates them in terms of what he calls the "paternal" Catholic modernism that characterized anti-Communism, and the "fraternal" modernism of antifascism. The former, which became official Vatican policy during the pontificates of Pius XI and Pius XII (at least through the war), represented "a form of Catholic modernism in which powerful, centralized, and secular states would protect the welfare, property, and rights of religious families" (66). With the integralism of throne and altar no longer a viable option, this seemed to many like the best way to preserve the freedom of the church and of Catholics. The latter, fraternal, option, characterized by the work of Jacques Maritain and Dietrich von Hildebrand, among others, developed a Catholic modernism that reconstituted institutions such as the family and the state around the common good of all (113). Its advocates thus tended to resist fascism on what were, basically, traditional Catholic grounds.

C.'s assessment of the antifascist and anti-Communist dynamics is helpful precisely because it sympathetically presents how these dynamics arose and differed from one another, as well as from earlier Catholic trajectories such as the aforementioned integralism. In his emphasis on Catholic modernism, C. occasionally misses connections between it and these older movements (in evidence, for example, when Reginald Garrigou-Lagrange infamously told Jacques Maritain that he endangered his soul by not supporting Vichy), but on the whole his analysis is detailed and will introduce most readers to figures and connections that might not have been apparent.

The rise and trajectory of Christian Democracy in Europe defines the aftermath of the war for Chappel's study. In C.'s assessment, the Christian Democratic parties that rose to prominence in many European countries succeeded "because they were able to corral religious conservatives, liberals, and secular nationalists under one center-right, constitutionalist banner" (151). This development resulted in a diminishment of the antifascist tradition as well as the Catholic role in silencing discussions about complicity with the Holocaust (158). The beginning of the Cold War played a strong role in these dynamics, particularly the strengthening of Catholic anti-Communist sentiment. C. views this later anti-Communist ascendancy as an outgrowth of the earlier movement that included erstwhile antifascists such as Jacques Maritain (168-69). This in turn influenced what C. calls the 1950s dynamic of "Christian Democratic modernism" both in Europe and the United States (183). C.'s assessment again is quite strong, although its categorizations miss, for example, continued Catholic support for authoritarianism after the war in places such as Franco's Spain. C.'s work concludes with several developments in the 1960s, notably the Catholic embrace of religious freedom at Vatican II and the rise of what he calls a "Catholic New Left." This conclusion ties the social movements of the 1960s—particularly movements for political and sexual liberation—to a revival of strands of Catholic modernism, particularly of the antifascist variety, that had been suppressed since the 1940s. This coda, which helps frame the book, also reveals perhaps its biggest weakness: its somewhat scattered treatment of theology, with an underdeveloped account of its influence. C's more thoroughgoing treatments of intellectual figures tend to feature philosophers such as Maritain and von Hildebrand. This is to some degree an inevitable function of limited space as well as specialization, but it ought to be kept in mind when reading the book to avoid reductionism.

C.'s work offers an immensely useful assessment of a critical period for the formation of Catholic attitudes and ideas that still resonate in today's church and secular politics. It is helpful for thinking through issues about religious freedom, the relationship between the church and secular politics, and the hermeneutics of assessing Pius XII's conduct during the wartime period. It brings grounded historical understanding to debates about the church and modernity that will be of great help to researchers on this period, on 20th-century European Catholicism broadly construed, and on church/world issues such as secularity.

Daniel Rober
Sacred Heart University, Fairfield, CT

In the Eye of the Animal: Zoological Imagination in Ancient Christianity. By Patricia Cox Miller. Divinations: Rereading Late Ancient Religion. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2018. Pp. 271. $79.95.

From lions and wolves to the humble earthworm, a stunning array of animals populates the writings of early Christians. In genres ranging from hagiography to theological treatises, authors contemplated the natural world and its implications for articulating a Christian worldview. As Patricia Cox Miller observes, a "powerful current" within early Christian literature affirms the exceptionality of the human animal through a "rhetoric of domination and superiority" (1). Contemporary scholars of critical theory and animal studies point to the anthropocentric bent of Christian thought, but M. marshals her encyclopedic knowledge of early Christian literature to tease out a frequently overlooked "countercurrent" she identifies as the "zoological imagination." Over the course of an introduction, five thematically coherent chapters, and an afterword, M. illustrates how writers exercised their zoological imagination to eschew the homogenized category of "animal" and trouble the animal–human binary through attention to the specificity and multiplicity of the non-human world.

The introduction offers readers a valuable overview of contemporary scholarship and the place of animals within humanistic inquiry. The author situates this work within the field of animality studies, which she identifies with historical study of animality "in relation to" human culture, to unsettle neat divisions between human and animal. The absence of advocacy for non-human animals, the author posits, distinguishes this field from its counterpart: animal studies (6). Shifting ancient and modern interlocutors as well as fauna, each chapter traces a facet of the zoological imagination and its implications for familiar concepts such as figuration, anthropomorphism, and ontology. The ways writers represented sympathetic relationality between humans and non-animal life weave throughout the case studies.

Moving animals from the periphery to the center of our inquiry, M. provides fresh avenues for approaching topics central to the study of the period. Attending to how writers invoked birds as figures for human qualities, M. addresses potent critiques of allegorical interpretation and metaphorical speech as obfuscating or even expunging the living, "literal" referent. Authors who employed allegorical reading strategies, M. avers, created relationships without necessarily instantiating hierarchies. Allegorical readers discerned the inner coherence of physical and spiritual realities: "Origen's reading of the aerial sensibility of human beings does not occlude real birds but actually brings them forward for examination" (18).

In a similar vein of underscoring affinity with non-human animals, early Christian writers both attributed human qualities to animals (anthropomorphism) and also imagined humans as animals (zoomorphism). These impulses "embed[ded] certain central tenets of Christianity deeply in the corporeal matrix of the created world" (84). While modern cognitive ethology employs anthropomorphism to understand animal behavior, M. shows how Christian anthropomorphism held up the ethical reasoning of animals as a model for believers navigating the challenges of embodied existence. Countering the charge that early Christian writers used animals merely as instruments

for advancing their rhetorical aims, M. applies the insights of affect theory to hagiography, highlighting this genre as a fecund site for configuring substantive human–animal relationships.

In the Eye of the Animal highlights how Christian authors thought "with" animals to underscore continuity between the human and non-human world and reflect on ethical reasoning, emotions, behaviors, and psychology. The zoological imagination also emerges as a mode of attention to the wonders of the natural world. Invoking the insights of Jane Bennett and the concept of "vibrant matter," M. turns to the swarms of smaller creatures—frogs, mosquitoes, and creeping crawlers—which attracted the curiosity and disgust of early Christians. Through Augustine's meditations on the beauty of worms, a polyvalent, positive ontology comes into focus as the binaries between life and matter, animal and human, begin to blur. Advancing previous arguments against the projection of Cartesian dualism onto ancient texts, M. demonstrates how writers contemplated the most diminutive of creatures as they wrestled with materiality and the grandeur of creation.

Through incandescent prose and close readings, this monograph charts new pathways for exploring the archive of Christian literature. This approach should spur further granular readings of individual authors to limn how the "zoological imagination" took shape in particular genres and locales. M. refuses to smooth over differences between Christian thought and philosophical orientations such as those of the "new materialists," instead offering a textured account of historical sources to challenge reductive over-simplifications. Most importantly for readers of this journal, *In the Eye of the Animal* contributes to the larger conversation among theologians, ethicists, historians, and critical theorists about the relationship of human and non-human animals. Ancient Christian writings reveal "an opening out of the human self to an engagement with other animals in matters of vulnerability and finitude, emotional expressions and psychological needs, in short a shared fundament of bodily life that had striking theological and ethical dimensions (192). As a result, *In the Eye of the Animal* trains us to see anew the breadth of early Christian literature in all its diversity and pulsing liveliness.

Erin Galgay Walsh
The University of Chicago Divinity School

Grund und Grenze des Verstehens. Theologie und Hermeneutik im Anschluss an Friedrich Schleiermacher. By Florian Priesemuth. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter. 2020. Pp. viii + 157. $91.99.

Hermeneutics is often considered to be a difficult and an esoteric part of philosophy, but as Wilhelm Dilthey wrote in "Die Entstehung der Hermeneutik" (1900), it is a necessary part of the human condition: "Our interaction universally presupposes the understanding of other persons." Dilthey praised Schleiermacher for founding the scientific approach to hermeneutics, and thus, any work that contributes to our understanding of what it means to "understand" and what Schleiermacher understood by

hermeneutics is welcomed. In spite of having some flaws, that includes Florian Priesemuth's *Grund und Grenze des Verstehens*.

P. recognizes the difficulty in attempting to understand Schleiermacher's hermeneutics. He begins with the assertion that understanding is in no way "self-evident," and he insists that Schleiermacher's hermeneutics has two parts: "art" and "critique" (1, 3). P. suggests that "art" is the attempt to come close to the author while "critique" expresses the need to maintain sufficient distance (25). Understanding also has two dimensions: the grammatical and the technical-psychological. Schleiermacher believed that style mattered and that an author should write in grammatically correct and stylishly clear sentences so as not to impede understanding. P. notes that the issue of style was important to Schleiermacher in his early reviews of books. We tend to think of Schleiermacher as a gentle person but P. quotes from one of Schleiermacher's reviews which reveals a cutting wit: "So much paper to waste in order to talk about the most trivial matter" (57). After discussing Schleiermacher's literary criticism, P. turns to his Plato translations. Hermeneutics not only aided Schleiermacher in determining the chronological order of Plato's dialogues but also helped in finding the harmony of being and thinking as well as of the formal and the real (71). This harmonization extends to Schleiermacher's own thought: hermeneutics and dialectic; hermeneutic and criticism; and finally, art and critique. P. also contends that underlying these is the combination of heuristic and hermeneutic as well. P.'s point seems to be that hermeneutics can never provide a definite answer but only a provisional one (46–49). This helps explain Schleiermacher's claim that the reader can understand the author better than the author himself. It is not that the reader has superior insight into the author's intensions; rather, the reader has the benefit of knowing more about the historical context of the author and his work (65).

P. maintains that Schleiermacher conceived his lectures on hermeneutics to correspond to his hermeneutic approach to the New Testament. Schleiermacher opined that adherence to dogma on the part of Catholicism and the Old Protestantism ensured that they would lack a hermeneutic approach to biblical exegesis. It was contemporary Protestantism that was open to a new understanding of the Bible, and in his view that meant an application of hermeneutic understanding and textual criticism (78–79). One part of this application was to determine which texts belonged to the canon and which did not; another task was to determine the relationship between the Old Testament and New Testament canons. These tasks were important for Schleiermacher, but the most critical one was to understand the New Testament itself correctly (80, 87), and this required continual practice (92–93). P. suggests that the goal of Schleiermacher's hermeneutics is a complete understanding, but he acknowledges that the hermeneutic work is an "infinite task" that can never be achieved (41, 135). Accordingly, understanding is the "foundation" (*Grund*) as well as the "limit" (*Grenze*) of both speech and text.

There are three problems with P's book. First, because he tried to cover so much of Schleiermacher's writings, he ends up glossing over important points. He spends a fair amount of time on Karl Bühler's theory of speech and Friedrich Schlegel's hermeneutics, and he devotes even more time to Schleiermacher's book reviews and his Plato translations. The result is that the amount of time devoted to Schleiermacher's use of

hermeneutics in connection to theology is not as extensive as one might wish. Second, he tends to hurry through his secondary sources rather than engage them (52, 64, 77). This is particularly troubling regarding Dilthey's work, especially insofar as P. himself noted that Dilthey was the first to recognize the importance of Schleiermacher's hermeneutics (2, 37). Third, there is only a brief discussion of Manfred Frank's work, and virtually none of Andrew Bowie's. Yet, Frank and Bowie are counted among the scholars most dedicated to understanding Schleiermacher's hermeneutics. In sum, while *Grund und Grenze des Verstehens* has its flaws, it is nonetheless a welcome addition to those works intended to help us understand Schleiermacher's conception of understanding.

Christopher Adair-Toteff
University of South Florida, Tampa, FLA

Confession: Catholics, Repentance, and Forgiveness in America. By Patrick W. Carey. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018. Pp. xiv + 375. $34.95.

"This book recalls how one segment of the American people, Catholics, understood penance and put it into practice" (3). Patrick W. Carey, emeritus professor at Marquette University, has written a detailed and illuminating volume on the history of penance as practiced among Catholics from the colonial era through Vatican II, and up to 2015. The meaning of Vatican II is history, as Bernard Lonergan has said, and C.'s historical perspective on penance recalls many developments and changes that cause one to reflect on one's own history as a member of the church. For this reviewer and many of his generation, 1963 was a watershed year of change, cultural and religious, from old habits to new possibilities. Among other events that impacted both society and church were the assassination of President John F. Kennedy and the presidency of Lyndon B. Johnson, with an acceleration of the war in Vietnam and the increasingly strong protests against it; the death of Pope John XXIII and the election of Pope Paul VI, who continued the deliberations of Vatican II; the approval of Vatican II's Constitution on the Liturgy and the incremental changes that followed it; and the first concert of the Beatles in the United States. C. does not use this particular date, but he does contrast the pre-Vatican II emphasis on individual, auricular confession with the later emphasis on communal reconciliation.

C. begins his study with a fine analysis of the doctrinal affirmations of Trent and early colonial penitential practices that followed Trent, as adapted to American circumstances. There follows the interesting court case in New York (1813) that affirmed the confessional seal. C. then details five American Protestant objections to sacramental confession. The most sensational concerned the perceived treatment of women in the confessional: "The nineteenth-century texts on the emotional and sexual seduction of confession contributed much to the Protestant crusade" (63). Chapters 4 and 5 treat the American Catholic theology of penance and the practice of confession in the 19th century, with a new emphasis on spiritual guidance and the communal or horizontal dimension of penance. While there were some developments, the real issue moving

into the 20th century was the place of the historical-critical method in spite of its suppression for some 50 years, beginning with Pope Pius X's anti-modernist crusade. "Between 1920 and 1960 the American-style liturgical, biblical, catechetical, and historical *ressourcement* reform movements were minority impulses within that dominant [post-Tridentine] culture" (196). Following chapter 6 on modernism, the next two cover the period from 1920 to 1960. Chapter 7 discusses conservative and liberal positions on the origins of private, auricular confession, which raise the question of historical continuity and development. Chapter 8 treats the emerging importance of psychology and the issue of birth control.

Chapter 9 reviews the period from 1960 to 2015: "A major paradigm shift in theology at the Second Vatican Council and in the period after the council transformed the emphasis on the sacrament of penance from confession of sins (i.e., the acts of the penitent) to reconciliation with God and with the church" (225). C. lists five major sites of subsequent controversy: the necessity of confession; the understanding of mortal sin in the light of the theology of fundamental option; the age of first confession in relation to first communion; the effectiveness of the new rites of penance; and the appropriate use of general absolution. All of these are important, but the changing and conflicting views of sin seem to be foundational. In summary he comments: "The new perspectives on penance that emerged in and after Vatican II, like those of the Council of Trent, will take generations, if not centuries, to effectuate" (269).

C. has written an admirable history of penance in the American Catholic tradition. This summary does not do justice to the rich and nuanced treatment of each period. His views are very balanced and he sees the validity of opposing positions so that the readers can get clarity on the many issues involved. I highly recommend it.

Michael L. Cook, SJ
Sacred Heart Jesuit Center, Los Gatos, CA

Jesuit Kaddish: Jesuits, Jews, and Holocaust Remembrance. By James Bernauer, SJ. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. xxx + 187. $55.

Jesuit Kaddish is an incisive and lucid work of "memory activism" examining the Holocaust and the Jesuits. It focuses a powerful light on a consequence of the "Original Injustice," the 1593 decision to ban admission to the Society of Jesus of men from "Hebrew or Saracen stock." This prohibition, a reversal of prior practice and in tension with Ignatius of Loyola's respect for the lineage of Jesus, remained in place until 1946. Haunted by the memory of the Holocaust, author James Bernauer has long ruminated about the tragic blindness of so many of his Jesuit brothers, even as righteous brethren such as Alfred Delp continue to inspire him.

This is not simply a book *about* Jesuits and Jews. Rather, it is permeated with Jesuit sensibilities and spirituality—and a summons to the Society of Jesus to formulate a statement of repentance. Chapter titles reflect major elements of the Society's tradition (e.g., examen, spiritual exercises) and significant works by its members, especially

The Divine Milieu and *The Barbarian Within.* His initial chapter, however, moves out of the Jesuit arc to explore Pope John Paul II's journey into an "ever deeper and more effective desire for a totally new relationship between Christians and Jews" (6). B. sees him as having provided a special service *to* the Jesuits. Briefly mentioning Pope John XXIII and *Nostra Aetate*, B. recounts some of the significant moments in the John Paul II papacy, including his visits to Auschwitz (1979), Rome's Great Synagogue (1986), and to Jerusalem's memorial museum, Yad Vashem (2000). Reference to this pope's mixed legacy would offer fuller context for assessing his impact.

The pairing of the chapters on Jesuit hostility to Jews and Judaism—the demonic milieu—and on those who were righteous—the divine milieu—is compelling. In the former, B. identifies an attitude he sees as a distinctive Jesuit posture on the Jewish question: *asemitism*, a "call to a nonviolent indifference to Jews . . . a walling in of the Church in the face of what was perceived as the overwhelming power" of Jews (30–31). He poignantly asks whether the Jesuit principle of indifference, found in the *Spiritual Exercises*, had sabotaged Jesuit capacity for empathy. Was Jesuit silence after Kristallnacht a consequence of indifference?

Before turning to the divine milieu of righteous Jesuits, B. draws from Walter Ong's notion of the "persistence of the barbarian within the communities of the cultured" (52). B. criticizes the narrow, rigid, and parochial Catholicism that equated morality with sexual purity and viewed obedience as radical submission. B. writes: "It is as if the long period of stress on a timeless natural law had made Christians deaf to the changing sounds of historically contingent evil" (61). For Jesuits, the blend of indifference and obedience too often resulted in conformity and hallowing of hierarchical structures.

Yet there were those who resisted, most notably the 15 Jesuits honored at Yad Vashem among the nearly 27,000 persons recognized as "Righteous of the Nations." B. sketches varying ways in which righteous Jesuits supported Jews, including rescuing children; preaching against National Socialism, narrow nationalism, and an insular Catholicism; forming circles of resistance; and fostering scholarship on Christian origins in relation to Judaism. Records reveal that 96 Jesuits were imprisoned at Dachau, including 31 who died there.

B. notes that history documents the actions of those who resisted, but not the spirituality that inspired and sustained them. He speculates that immersion in Scripture may have played a role. Pre-eminent among those shaped by biblical texts was the Old Testament scholar Augustin Cardinal Bea, the long-serving rector of Rome's Biblical Institute, where he helped to hide Jews. Bea's formative role before, during, and after Vatican II is well-known. B., however, documents how Bea evolved over the years, moving from conventional views on Judaism to more nuanced ones as he engaged with Jews.

In his concluding chapter, B. returns to the reflective mode of his prelude. Given his earlier statement that Günter Grass's novel *Crabwalk* was a metaphor for his feelings about the Holocaust, this chapter mirrors that metaphor, moving along without the cogency of the previous chapters. Two issues in particular are puzzling: (1) the brevity and lack of substantive detail in his section on "Jesus the Jew", and (2) the scarcity of

reference to Pope Francis, B.'s Jesuit brother. Briefly pointing to Francis's cordial relations with Argentina's Jews prior to his election to the papacy in 2013, B. omits mention of his deep friendship and collaboration with Rabbi Avraham Skorka, as well as the openness Francis has shown to interreligious reconciliation. B. ends with his own "Statement of Jesuit Repentance," a draft for his brothers to ponder.

Jesuit Kaddish is a profound and poignant book, grounded in meticulous and extensive archival research and carried by the passion of its author.

Mary C. Boys, SNJM
Union Theological Seminary, New York

Theology Without Walls: The Transreligious Imperative. Edited by Jerry L. Martin. New York: Routledge: 2019. Pp xviii + 250. $155.

Jerry L. Martin, a politically engaged philosopher and theologian, established a group at the American Academy of Religions some years ago called "Theology Without Walls" (TWW). This book grew out of that seminar. He defines this theology, negatively, as "not limited to a single tradition" or to "confessional restrictions," and, positively, as appealing to "revelations, enlightenments, and insights" into ultimate reality that come from other religious traditions as well as other sources. For example, "literature, philosophy, psychology, anthropology, and the natural and social sciences . . . may become important sources of theological insight" (1). In short, ultimate reality exceeds every single faith tradition, and theology should respond accordingly.

The extraordinary character of this book lies in several qualities. It assembles a symposium of twenty-two voices, many of whom are the leaders of contemporary theology; it touches on most of the resources and approaches noted in the definition; the writers are expert, and each contributes something distinctive to the discussion in seven to 12 pages; the wide range of perspectives and methods of approaching theology is impressive; and, while all the voices sing about the same subject, they do not share the same key or sing the same song. Some order in the exchange has been imposed by a five-part structure of the book, each one ably introduced by M.

In Part I, Robert Neville, Richard Oxenberg, Christopher Denny, and Kurt Richardson show that, rather than being a problem-resolving discipline, an open theology entails patience and process. It includes going beneath revelations and doctrines to the experiences they symbolize. TWW can be called "open-field" theology. But early on in the reading one finds a persistent resistance to the metaphor of "walls" applied to specific traditions as though beliefs and rituals were laws confining transcendence.

Part II offers broad positive discussion of TWW from John Thatamanil, Paul Knitter, Peter Savastano, Rory McEntee, and Jonathan Weidenbaum. The expansion of the sources of theology represents a quest for wisdom; dual belonging exemplifies the project's merits by expanding the meaning of the language on both sides. The wider horizon of the theologian forces a plunge into the more communicable spirituality

encoded in faith traditions or humanistic disciplines. William James shows how a turn to religious experience compromises neither the concern nor the criteria for truth.

Part III offers two principal challenges to the project; both are illuminating. Peter Feldmeier raises the question of the audience of TWW: who is it for? The question generates its own answer: this theology does not replace other theologies as an alternative but is simply a new initiative. Wesley Wildman, Johan De Smedt, and Helen De Cruz raise the other caution: all theology has to be in dialogue with science, which forms part of the universal or "trans" character of this enterprise. Across the board, science challenges theology's anthropomorphism.

Part IV offers suggestions on method in TWW. J. R. Hustwit and Jeanine Diller bring to bear the logics of hermeneutical theology which show in very clear terms how appropriating the other does not contradict affiliation to a particular faith tradition. Paul Hedges draws on East Asian fluidity or openness to various traditions in religious practice as a counterpoint to Western insistence on consistency of beliefs and identity. Linda Mercadante highlights the massive withdrawal from affiliation that runs parallel to a growing interest in TWW in North America. Her phenomenology invites a thesis on the relation between the two.

Part V rounds out the discussion with considerations from what is called confessional theologies focused in a specific historical tradition. Mark Heim and Frank Clooney, who represent a disciplined comparative theology as distinct from open eclecticism, react against the misleading view of beliefs as blinders instead of universal heuristic lenses. Jeffrey Long demonstrates how a confessional religion—the Vedanta tradition of Ramakrishna, for example—can embrace a TWW within itself, and Hyo-Dong Lee gives an autobiographical account of an expansive movement through particular traditions to a truly personal faith stance.

This book goes a long way toward introducing this new threshold of theology with extended point and counterpoint. The collection shows several sets of allies along different axes. But pluralism reigns throughout. No recapitulation sums up this project. The said and the unsaid, position and retort, reveal the unsettled character of this discussion across the spectrum of theological harmony and dissonance. There can be no final judgment on this project without a discussion such as this, and it is one that is far from over. The book provides an excellent introduction to what Wilfred Cantwell Smith called "World Theology." He would be pleased with the range and quality of this discussion.

Roger Haight, SJ
Union Theological Seminary

Divine Action and the Human Mind. By Sarah Lane Ritchie. Current Issues in Theology. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019. Pp. xi + 373. $120; $96.

Ritchie's work is a welcome contribution to the field of theology and science, and is part of a growing body of literature responding to perceived weaknesses in the decades-long Divine Action Project. Her goal is simultaneously to critique accounts of

divine action that hold that emergent realities, like the mind, are ontologically distinct from physical reality (and thus more open to divine influence) and to challenge Nicholas Saunders's claim that divine action theology is in a state of crisis (31).

R.'s work is divided into two parts. The first part offers a "deflationary" (189) account of divine action theories in general, and in particular critiques Philip Clayton's argument that the mind, as a non-physical, emergent reality, serves as a particular locus of divine activity. R. surveys non-interventionist accounts of divine action, and, following closely the argument of Nicholas Saunders, argues that those theories which rely on a so-called causal joint through which God can act perpetuate a deistic metaphysics, privilege dubious interpretations of scientific knowledge, and fail Wesley Wildman's theodicy test. Turning to Clayton's model, she argues that consciousness and the mind are indeed physical, or at least embodied, realities and that dualistic accounts of the brain–mind relationship are merely the result of our limited linguistic frameworks.

In the second part, R. surveys three different theistic naturalisms that are paradigmatic of the "theological turn" in the religion–science dialogue: Thomism; panentheism, as found in the logos theology of Orthodox theologian Christopher C. Knight; and the pneumatological naturalism of Radical Orthodoxy scholar James K. A. Smith and Pentecostal theologian Amos Yong. In these theistic naturalisms, R. sees a potential rebuttal to Saunders's crisis claim insofar as they can affirm "divine action in embodied—perhaps physical—human consciousness" (342).

Though explicitly not constructive, R.'s analysis of the shortcomings of both the Divine Action Project and theistic naturalisms points towards a set of criteria for constructing a more robust theory of divine action. According to her analysis, any such theory must (1) be capable of meaningful engagement with scientific inquiry without relying on dubious interpretations of scientific theory, (2) avoid implicit recourse to the so-called causal-joint, (3) maintain an "ontological gap" between God and creation so as prevent a slide into pantheism, and (4) allow for a defensible account of the suffering and cruelty that seems an inherent part of God's creative process in the world.

Interestingly, R. seems divided about the extent to which divine action theories must be held accountable to science. She writes: "DAP tended to submit theological affirmations to scientific scrutiny—rather than the other way around," and "the DAP was highly motivated to demonstrate divine action as *scientifically* credible" (8). Given the critical tone of both these passages, it is surprising that the theistic naturalisms R. identifies, especially the varieties of participatory ontologies she explores, are critiqued *because* they cannot be submitted to scientific verification. Indeed, one wonders what the theological implications would be if God's providence could be subjected to scientific quantification. The apologetic role of divine action theories, it seems, must be untangled from the pursuit of a theological understanding of the world which can, at the same time, affirm scientific knowledge.

R. expresses the potential concern that "theological accounts of scientifically explainable phenomena are redundant" (337). This concern directly relates to the ontological assumptions of the metaphysics she proposes for accounts of divine action, namely that one must maintain the ontological gap between God and creation (247).

One wonders, however, if the hard ontological break between God and creatures that R. posits is really appropriate to participatory ontologies that understand God as the ground of all being, not *a* being. Likewise, does the distinction between "natural and supernatural" do justice to the doctrines of creation that arise within these different theistic naturalisms, especially those that presume a participatory ontology and hold that all created things participate in God's own act-of-being (a category that includes thinkers such as Thomas Aquinas, Karl Rahner, Elizabeth Johnson, and William Stoeger)? R. notes that the distinction between created and uncreated is more appropriate in the Orthodox context, but does not, due to the constraints of space, explore the full implications of the difference implied in these categories and the significance of them for the dialogue between theology and science (274).

Finally, R. explicitly references William R. Stoeger in "allowing a riot of images and concepts to modify and qualify one another" (342) as one works toward a robust theory of divine action. Surely, however, the ways the symbol of God functions in Process, Thomistic, Orthodox, and Charismatic theologies are different enough to require more constructive bridge-building between them than R. has had the space to do in this text. These limitations and concerns aside, R.'s engaging and thought-provoking work is worthy of careful consideration by scholars working at the intersection of theology and science. Her juxtaposition of Thomistic, Orthodox, and Pentecostal thought is especially intriguing and one hopes that it will encourage more interdenominational dialogue and collaboration in this field.

Amanda R. Alexander
Claremont School of Theology, Claremont CA

Balance of Powers: Für eine neue Gestalt des kirchlichen Amtes. By Thomas Ruster. Regensburg: Friedrich Pustet, 2019. Pp. 231. €22.

The particular problem this book addresses is nothing other than the "priest shortage," which is depriving many Catholic communities of regular access to the celebration of the Eucharist. Thomas Ruster proposes a structure for dealing with this shortage, with a focus on the parishes or other communities most affected. The outlines of his model are summed up in the opening and concluding chapters of the book (chapters 1 and 10). Let me note first that the English title of this German book of course calls to mind the American Constitution and its distribution of the powers of government in a triad: the "legislative power," the "executive power," and "the judicial power." R.'s study of ways to remodel authority structures in the Catholic Church after the Second Vatican Council, however, even though threefold as well, is based on Scripture and tradition. The triad focused on here is that of priest, prophet, and king, as taken up in the Second Vatican Council's 1964 Constitution, *Lumen Gentium* (Dogmatic Constitution on the Church).

The proposal, laid out in chapter 1 and the concluding chapters of the book under review, is that bishops ordain apt and willing men and/or women of the local churches, to celebrate Mass where needed in parishes.

Chapters 2 through 5 take up the trilogy that Vatican II adopted, in chronological order, as understood in its previous settings. First the Bible: in chapter 2 R. assembles relevant data from the Old Testament, such as Moses prophesying a king (in Dt 16:14, 18:1–15), setting up the Levitical priesthood, and declaring "The Lord your God will raise up for you a prophet like me." Chapter 3 examines how the triad gets applied principally to Jesus the Christ, and in this is way shared with the whole church of the baptized. The theme of God's call and our vocation receives proper consideration (chapter 4), as does the place of the priest in traditional Catholic experience (chapters 5 and 6). R. lays all this out with critical precision and copious references to his sources. Among the questions that arise: is this proposal for priestly ordinations compatible with the *character indelibilis* of the sacrament of ordination, as in baptism and confirmation (100)?

Since the Reformation the role of the priest was more and more emphasized in Catholicism as the one who presides over the foremost celebration of Christ's saving action, the Eucharistic liturgy. Oddly enough, however, as the biblical triad of the offices of Christ faded to the margins in Catholic awareness, Protestant preachers and theologians (especially Calvinist and Anglo-American ones) brought them to the fore.

Chapter 6 on the *public* character of liturgical worship brings up some church–state issues that preoccupied Catholics in the 20th century grappling with fascism, Nazism, and democracy, among other things. Some thinkers, such as Erik Peterson (1890–1960), wrestled with these conflicting claims from a historical perspective. Moving to more recent times, contemporary students of the threefold-office theme receive particular attention, for example, Peter Drilling, Geoffrey Wainwright, Bernd Wannenwetsch, and Robert Sherman.

With chapter 7, R. returns to the christological center of the *tria-munera* set. The Code of Canon Law sets the terms for the ordination and commissioning of priests. In 1959 Pope John XXIII urged the Second Vatican Council to consider an updating of Canon Law. The new Code of Canon Law (1983) remains hobbled by a calcified model of authority in the church as a matter primarily of "jurisdiction" and/or "order." Vatican II avoided that distinction in 1964, speaking more generally of a "*potestas sacra*." A "*tria-munera*" model may provide a more supple alternative to this previous binomial distinction, and with it the presumed one-sided subjection of "the laity" to "the official church." Here R. repeatedly cites *Das Dreifache Amt Christi und der Kirche* (1982) by Ludwig Schick (since 2002, the archbishop of Bamberg). The patristic church paid sustained attention to the three offices of Christ. Schick noted that in the Middle Ages the theologians of the (Latin?) church "did not reflect further upon either the Christological or the Christological-anthropological ternary of earlier tradition" (quoted on 146). This went together with the dominance of philosophical thinking in theological treatises, over a more biblical and historical focus.

The Second Vatican Council did wrestle with these issues of "*aggiornamento*" and had recourse to the *tria munera* in several places, as R. notes (181–185). R.'s final

chapter sums up the shift in Vatican II to a biblical-theological basis for a renewed ecclesiology, and then proceeds to deal with the challenges of putting his proposals into practice. The role of bishops is certainly not downplayed—quite the opposite! The rethinking of the relationship of the baptized members of the Body of Christ and their fellow baptized who are also ordained must be undertaken on a broader scale. Theologians and canonists must do their part too. Wherefore I heartily recommend this book.

Paul Misner
Marquette University, Milwaukee, WI

Fundamental Theology. By Guy Mansini, OSB. *Sacra Doctrina*. Washington, DC: The Catholic University of America Press, 2018. Pp. vi + 291. $24.95.

Mansini's work is a contribution to neoscholastic-style fundamental theology. It is fundamentally theological with some apologetic sections (such as chapters 5 and 6). The content focuses on explicating the basic categories of systematic theology organized by a dialogical structure: God speaks, humans hear, with a section of four chapters on each.

Chapter 1 is an extended reflection on *Dei Verbum* 2, which speaks about pattern of revelation being manifested in deeds and words. M. emphasizes the unity of salvation history, especially in its christological form. His typological interpretation of wisdom as the unifying theme of the Old and New Testaments is succinct and enlightening, tying together multiple themes using the theme of Jesus as the wisdom of God. Less attractive is his strong emphasis on a propositional theory of revelation, arguing that non-propositional theories fall into various errors. A short second chapter situates tradition and the things handed on as coexistent with Scripture, church, and doctrine.

Chapter 3 treats Scripture through four themes: its content, the canon, inspiration, and inerrancy. In treating inspiration, M. is dismissive of a historical-critical approach, following Josef Ratzinger to argue that it replaces a theological principle of interpretation with a human method. In fact, it is unclear whether there is *any* place for historical-critical work in M.'s theological vision. Inerrancy is the most complicated of the chapter-3 topics. M. argues for "unrestricted inerrancy" (101) in response to a set of metaphysical, moral, and historical criticisms, although "unrestricted" is later qualified by the acknowledgement that inventions and inaccuracies are contained in the scriptural narrative.

Chapter 4 turns to the church and dogma. The propositional focus comes to the fore again, as M. defines a dogma as "an authoritative formulation of revealed truth" (122). Not wishing to say there is no development of dogmatic formulations, M. proposes that the historicity of dogma be measured by its conformity to Christ.

Part II turns to the reception of God's word. Chapter 5 deals with the *praeambula fidei*, which, consistent with his theological intent, M. does not treat in a solely philosophical manner. He argues that revelation required some kind of natural knowledge of God, especially the conviction that something transcends material reality. This type of argumentation is more general than many natural theologies but nevertheless very

effective. M. especially ties that which transcends material reality to philosophical reflection that is trans-cultural and trans-temporal, which he equates with the ancient Greek culture of Plato and Aristotle.

Chapter 6 turns to credibility, a category that straddles (or perhaps interweaves) the space between faith and reason. M. acknowledges that it is a strange notion, with the supernatural credibility of revelation manifesting prior to the act of faith in a rationally apprehensible way. Although M. identifies six areas of credibility, at least four of those are reducible to just one topic: "it all comes back to a certain whole thing [the economy of salvation] perceived as a whole" (196). That is, it is necessary to establish the proper horizon of interpretation, and when this is done, the credibility of the other areas follow. This procedure allows M. to say that Jesus's words are "self-credible" (190), and that the credibility of the resurrection comes from being able to put it in the context of the pattern of revelation.

Chapter 7 addresses faith, which M. understands as cognitive and assent to a proposition. Faith is made credible by the miracles of Jesus and supernaturalizes human subjectivity in conversion. Perhaps because of the cognitive and propositionalist focus, there is no discussion of love. This lacuna leaves one with the impression that faith contains the whole of supernatural life.

Finally, M. turns to a discussion of 20th-century theology, which he breaks down into modernism, *la nouvelle théologie*, and scholasticism, or theology as a(n Aristotelian) science. M. is critical of modernism, and sees the future of theology as a combination of the experiential, contextual, and historical concerns of *la nouvelle théologie* and the rigor and dogmatic adherence of scholasticism.

Reception of this book will largely be shaped by whether one thinks neoscholastic fundamental theology is a praiseworthy endeavor. For those that do, M.'s focus on the propositional content of revelation and dogma, faith as assent to a proposition, his criticisms of historical analysis and non-propositional accounts of revelation will be welcome. For critics, the propositional focus will seem unnecessarily limiting, while his dismissal of historical critical studies and insistence on starting with the pattern of revelation will make the integration of insights from those areas into systematic theology difficult, if not impossible.

David Rohrer Budiash
Washington, DC

That All Shall Be Saved: Heaven, Hell, and Universal Salvation. By David Bentley Hart. New Haven/London: Yale University Press, 2019. Pp. 222. $26.

The first task in reading any work is to determine its "literary form." This present work by David Bentley Hart falls firmly in the category of polemic. It is not an academic work in theology. There are no footnotes or a bibliography. None of his opponents, apart from the historical figures of Calvin, Augustine, and perhaps Aquinas, is given a name, merely "a venerable Catholic philosopher", "certain Thomists of my

acquaintance", or an "evangelical apologist," and so on. More importantly we never hear from these anonymous opponents in their own voice, only through a jaundiced lens provided by the author. His opponents, labelled "infernalists," are described as accepting "incoherence as profundity, or moral idiocy as spiritual subtlety" (19); they suffer from chronic "intellectual and moral malformation" (21), or "one or two emotional pathologies" (25). Although he does not want to impugn anyone's sincerity, they are "deceiving" themselves (29); they employ "cunning and desperate devices" (44); their arguments yield "at best only gibberish, at worst cynical sophistries" (47). I could go on—but perhaps the reader by now has some sense of H.'s polemic stance.

The purpose of this polemic is to convince the reader of H.'s central thesis, that hell, understood as a state of eternal suffering, simply does not exist. He admits that this goal is "presumptuous of me" (31), but is absolutely convinced of the rectitude of his position.

The argument unfolds over seven chapters. The first two set the scene, framing the question and doubting the traditional answers. There are then four meditations: the first spells out an argument on the basis of divine goodness and the moral meaning of *creatio ex nihilo*; the second examines the scriptural data of the New Testament, drawing on universalist theme in the Pauline letters, and examining the various references to post-mortem punishment in the words of Jesus; the third asks about the nature of personhood as being fundamentally oriented to God and made in the image and likeness of God; and the fourth considers one's freedom as finite and conditioned by a context beyond our making and hence never deserving of eternal punishment. There is a final chapter of concluding remarks. H. draws extensively from the writings of Gregory of Nyssa as a patristic proponent of his universalist stance; indeed, Gregory is the only theological source (apart from Scripture) who receives more than scant attention.

The target of H.'s polemic appears to be a vision of hell promoted in popular religiosity and some traditions of preaching that is clearly problematic and so makes an easy target. They turn God into an "indefatigably vindictive" (201) and sadistic monster, unworthy of worship. But the polemic nature of the argument also sweeps aside carefully made distinctions and positions, notably those around the problem of evil (e.g., God's "permissive will"), around questions of the fixity of evil post-mortem (what is the metaphysics of change in a disembodied soul?), and Aquinas's position of the relationship between the blessed in heaven and the damned. But then none of these are heard in their own voice, only through H.'s thundering dismissal.

Occasionally H. concedes some ground to a possible alternative. "I do in fact believe in hell, though only in the sense of a profound and imprisoning misery that we impose upon ourselves by rejecting the love that alone can set us free" (62). Still, even then God eventually wears down this rejection. And in his final meditation he notes "the argument from free will: that hell exists simply because . . . there must be some real alternative to God open to that creature's power of choice," a position he says is "wrong in every way, but not contemptibly so" (171). So those who hold an alternative position are not completely contemptible.

Some other issues are worth noting. H. builds his position on a Platonic notion of sin as based in ignorance. To choose sin is irrational and hence arises from a lack of knowledge. Remove ignorance and sin becomes impossible. Such a stance makes sin a cognitive issue rather than an issue of willingness versus willfulness. This may explain a lacuna, the question of the fallen angels. Given that their intellects are not clouded in the ways human intellects are clouded, how is their fall even possible? H. does not deny their existence but provides no framework to "explain" their fallenness. Also, H. quotes the universalist text of Philippians 2:9–11, but omits v.12 where Paul talks about working out our salvation in "fear and trembling"—a glaring oversight.

A more major theological concern is the underlying soteriology at work, which is pretty thin. Jesus does not proclaim a message of "it's all okay, you're all going to heaven in the end." His urgent message is "repent, the kingdom of God is at hand." H. describes the work of Jesus as reorienting "humanity again towards its true goal" (141), but given that this goal is, in H.'s own terms, ineradicably embedded in the human heart, why is this orientation needed? And how is it achieved? What is the role of Jesus's death and resurrection in this process? And of the church as a community mediating sacramental grace? Perhaps these issues will be explored in some future work.

The book has already become a *cause célèbre*, with various reviews either promoting or condemning it. It is clearly a controversialist work, and H. has given his critics equal measure in return. Despite this notoriety, this is not a work I would want to use in a course on eschatology. Its polemic nature makes it a poor model for theology students. Opponents are not treated with respect, or their position carefully spelt out, simply dismissed on the authority of the author. Engagement with relevant theological literature is minimal to non-existent. The author is on a mission. Whether it is from God or not remains to be seen.

Neil Ormerod
Sydney College of Divinity

That All May Flourish: Comparative Religious Environmental Ethics. Edited by Laura M. Hartman. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 2018. Pp. xi + 312. $35.

Addressing the question, "Is a mutual flourishing that does not come at the expense of people or ecosystems possible?" Laura Hartman has assembled an interdisciplinary team of scholars from the U.K., Nigeria, Canada, and the U.S. Their chapters and dialogues are rooted in comparative religious ethics (including the Jewish, Christian, Islamic, Hindu, Buddhist, Daoist, and Confucian traditions). Problems examined as challenges to flourishing include the food we eat, animals, climate change, and genetic engineering. Rather than "sustainability," this team has selected "flourishing" as its focus. Feminist theologian Grace Janzen describes flourishing as "abundance, overflowing with vigor and energy and productiveness, success, and good health" (7). "Flourishing" seems a well-chosen concept that can apply to humans, animals, plants, and organisms with equal rigor.

A unique aspect of the book is H.'s pairing of scholars around themes such as "Flourishing and its Costs", "Animals and Care", and "Climate and Care" to engage in a dialogue appearing after each two chapters. The goal of the dialogue is constructively to critique each other's chapters and to look for points of similarity and difference. Involving scholars from different religions and disciplines, the dialogues offer some of the more interesting parts of the book. Often, however, they are too brief to do justice to the issues raised. Also, single chapters are not able to cover whole traditions. Instead, we are given particular perspectives compared on specific environmental problems. These glimpses evidence points of convergence and divergence demanding more research. H.'s hope is that "such insights can highlight differences between the world we have and the world as it ought to be" (8). Starting with concepts such as flourishing is a way to unite conversation partners from diverse disciplines, cultures, and religions in which past divides have caused generations of tragedy and environmental degradation.

How well is H.'s goal realized? After a good introduction to flourishing and comparative religious environmental ethics, the book sets forth "flourishing and its costs" in chapters 1, "Buddha, Aristotle, and Science on rediscovering the value of flourishing in nature" by Colette Sciberras, and 2, "Eating, Glimpsing God's Infinite Goodness" by Nelson Reveley, which examines how eating involves suffering and death for animals and plants—an ethical challenge for Christians who believe in God's grace. The application of flourishing to farming and death is particularly well done, making good use of Wendell Berry and Norman Wirzka to show that even though eating involves the taking of life, it can still entail God's grace. For Buddhism (with no creator God) the flourishing of human and non-human life is an inherent good for all beings; respect for their flourishing is a fundamental duty. Of the dialogues following each two chapters, the dialogue between Sciberras and Reverley, who point to aspects of similarity and difference between Christianity and Buddhism, sets the bar high (70–73). Some of the others are much weaker. Chapter 3 is a true back-and-forth dialogue between the authors on the contributions of Buddhist and Christian conceptions of flourishing to environmental ethics. Their exchanges evidence deep scholarship in concise comparative analysis that includes different schools of thought from each tradition.

The chapters in section II focus on "Animals and Care" in relation to "flourishing" as understood in Daoism (David Cooper) and Islam (Sarah Robinson-Bertoni). Both offer well-researched analyses of relationships with nature. H.'s pairing of Daoism with Islam on animals works surprisingly well.

Section III, "Climate and Culture" in India and Mali (Islam) has serious weaknesses. Chapter 7 by Christopher Miller, "Yoga Bodies and Bodies of Water," while well researched and interesting, focuses on the politics of India's Prime Minister Narendra Modi rather than "flourishing" in environmental ethics, and thus does not fit the thematic focus of the book. As this is the only chapter dealing with Hinduism, the result is the exclusion from the analysis of "flourishing" of the Hindu view of the earth and its beings as God's body—an unfortunate result for a comparative-religions approach to environmental ethics. Epstein-Levi's chapter 10 on "Genetic Engineering, Jewish and Rabbinic Text" offers an excellent case study on similarities between DNA and scriptural text. Jennifer Phillips's chapter 11, "Environmental Issues in Catholic

Social Teachings," provides insightful discussion of "flourishing ethics for contemporary crises." Both chapters ground themselves in feminist perspectives. Neither shies away from grappling with the challenges of the science and technology of genetics in relation to solutions enabling environmental flourishing in the future. Section VI, "Respect and Relationality," has a chapter on Confucian environmental ethics as flourishing rather than human-centered or destructive (chapter 16 by Cheryl Cottine), and a chapter on "Flourishing in an African Landscape," an ethnographic study of how the Khao-o Dama people in Namibia relate to animals such as lions (chapter 17 by Michael Hannis and Sian Sullivan). In their dialogue the authors challenge the "wilderness" assumption of moderns that it is necessary to move beyond the human to have an acceptable environmental ethic. Both chapters, in different ways, reject this "wilderness contention" and instead put forward the necessity of healthy relationships with all entities comprising the environment—humans and non-human others—so as to care for both "them" and "us" (197).

With accessible chapters covering a range of academic disciplines and religious traditions, this book should be studied by scholars and educated lay readers of environmental ethics. Theologians and philosophers will find wisdom from the "flourishing" approach to environmental ethics, not only in their own traditions but in other religious traditions as well. Students will find the brief dialogue chapters an easy entry into key questions.

Harold Coward
University of Victoria, Victoria, Canada

Consciencia, discernimiento y verdad. By Julio J. Martínez, SJ. Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2019. Pp. xxviii + 393. €24.04.

The theological ethicist, Julio L. Martínez, SJ, trained in fundamental moral theology and social ethics in Madrid, Salamanca, and Boston, presents his fifteenth book, an impressive homage to Pope Francis for his undying dedication to "untying the knots in the church" ("*desatar nudos en la Iglesia*"). Now in his eighth year as Rector-President of the Pontifical University of Comillas, M. demonstrates an extraordinary ability to communicate rather dense theological insights with a clarity and brevity that he has honed as a major intellectual administrator. This particular work will assuredly become a classic.

The first three of the seven chapters have a total of 45 subsections serving as signposts illuminating our pathway as we consider church teaching from *Humanae vitae* to *Veritatis Splendor* to *Amoris Laetitia*. The first chapter on the framework through which we must move begins with John Courtney Murray's claim that theologians pursue theological insight precisely to care for souls. The theologian's pastoral ministry includes the responsibility from *Veritatis Gaudium* (4) to resolve conflicts through discernment. As M. concludes his first chapter, he invokes the new evangelization and reminds us that by engaging the Christian conscience illuminated by the gift of faith, the theologian discovers both the beginning and the end of one's pastoral service.

The second chapter, on the moral-anthropological bases needed to address the challenge at hand, conveys M.'s impressive capacity to instruct on the plethora of resources at the disposal for such a theological endeavor. Here he provides 17 illuminating syntheses to enlighten our way. Beginning with a Rahnerian understanding of human freedom as the gift that fundamentally orients us to the good, he insists that human freedom is "unfailingly situated" ("*indefectiblemente situada*") or irretrievably historical, and that any lack of human freedom correspondingly diminishes human dignity. The first half of the chapter concludes by arguing that human liberty flourishes or blooms when it sinks its roots into the truth (or destiny) of human nature. For the second half, following the claim that to be is to be in and for relationality, personalism is proffered as a worthy way to see conscience as the portal between human freedom and the truth.

The third chapter unfolds with the claim that any account of any compromise of Vatican II inevitably is due to a lack of appreciation for the development of doctrine. Following Josef Fuchs and Klaus Demmer, M. argues that that development is a constitutive mandate for the work of magisterial teaching: fidelity to the tradition requires innovation to develop its "growing edge" ("*el borde creciente*"). In this light, he begins his encounter with the phenomenon of *Humanae vitae*, in particular the unwavering authority imposed on it by Pope John Paul II after the Cologne Declaration. Contrasting doctrinal development as evident in social ethics against its considerable absence in moral theology, M. asks whether the church suffers from a double standard in the conscientious pursuit of moral truth.

In the light of *Amoris Laetitia*, personal discernment occupies chapter 4 and communal discernment, chapter 5. M.'s agenda to find the pastoral strategy to unresolved moral challenges aligns with Pope Francis's call to promote the personal and collective search for learning God's will by accompanying in conscience those struggling to understand the truth. The fifth chapter—particularly when it comes to its use of Scripture to highlight the church's long-standing confidence in communal discernment guided by the Holy Spirit—rivals the second chapter as the most brilliant one.

In the sixth chapter, we see the inevitable necessity for *Amoris* in the light of *Veritatis Splendor*, or what M. refers to as the "chronicle of a necessary evolution" ("*crónica de una evolución necessaria*"). Here we witness Francis untying the knots against the background of a host of earlier attempts. The closing chapter is a tribute to conscience with 32 theological meditations, if you will, on the wellspring of the Christian capacity to hear the call of Christ and realize it.

M. writes as a senior scholar assured of the theological insights that he has evidently shared with others, from students to colleagues, both faculty and administrators, as well as informed, devout laity in the professional world. This confident work bears, in its resources and in M.'s telling, a comprehensive hope that discernment is the right pathway for conscience freely and unfailingly to pursue the truth.

With a humorous touch, the ever-loquacious M. offers a denouement of 12 takeaways that he humorously calls "The Final Balance."

James F. Keenan, SJ
Boston College

Transubstantiation: Theology, History, and Christian Unity. By Brett Salkeld. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2019. Pp. xv + 270. $29.99.

It might be best to frame Brett Salkeld's work in *Transubstantiation* with the Anglican-Roman Catholic International Commission's comments in the 1979 *Elucidation* on their 1971 *Eucharistic Doctrine*. Summarizing criticism on the initial agreed statement, the commission reports: "The word *become* has been suspected of expressing a materialistic conception of Christ's presence, and this has seemed to some to be confirmed in the footnote on the word *transubstantiation* which also speaks of *change*" (paragraph 6, quoted p. 18). S. argues that by avoiding transubstantiation, ecumenical agreements of the 1970s and 1980s hindered ecumenical progress by a troubling ambiguity. He notes, for instance, that the section on presence in *Eucharistic Doctrine* was accused of being "both too real, and not real enough" (23), a fate which could have been avoided if it had defined the term transubstantiation. S. claims that transubstantiation appears to be an ecumenical stumbling block only because many Catholics and Protestants wrongly believe the word refers to a physical change. A retrieval of the Thomistic doctrine and its implications for ecumenical agreement on the Eucharist, then, occupies most of the book.

S.'s critique in the frame chapters is carefully reserved to Catholic laity misunderstanding the doctrine of transubstantiation, their educators, and a minority of Protestant theologians and clergy members receiving ecumenical agreements. He cites a number of theologians, Catholic and Protestant, academic and popular, conciliar and more recent, whose theologies of presence are adequate. Among these, Pope Benedict XVI's works seem to play the largest role in the argument, followed by Robert Barron and Herbert McCabe (though he critiques Barron's and Benedict's reading of Luther and Calvin). The prescription (for a right understanding of transubstantiation) is a retrieval of Thomas Aquinas's doctrine, which was muddied in later centuries by the rise of nominalism and by Reformation-era polemics and distrust.

The historical and scholastic exposition in chapter 2 is best understood as a reassurance to Protestant ecumenists who are non-specialists in eucharistic theology and as a clarification to Catholics. S.'s explanation of Thomas Aquinas's doctrine of transubstantiation in its historical context will not be new to specialists, but it is clear, precise, and more careful than comparable resources. It should be accessible even to undergraduates reading Thomas for the first time. Like the 1979 Anglican-Catholic agreement, S. concludes that transubstantiation is "a kind of *via negativa*" (133) which preserves the connection between the sacrament's symbolic function and the presence of Christ in it.

S's readings of Martin Luther and John Calvin are as sympathetic and contextually acute as his reading of Thomas. In the second half of the book (chapter 3 on Luther, and chapter 4 on Calvin), he argues that the collapse of substance under nominalism, in the wake of Duns Scotus, made it impossible for Luther, Calvin, and their contemporaries to read transubstantiation as a defense of a sacramental position. He pays significant attention to their debates with fellow Reformers and their development in response to emerging positions. In each chapter he argues that a Thomistic model of

transubstantiation would have represented their principal concerns, but also provided an approach to an additional theological problem that plagued their debates with more Zwinglian opponents.

One of the limitations of this project is intrinsic to its scope: though Luther and Calvin are treated sympathetically, other Reformation figures appear only via secondary scholarship. Contemporary ecumenical proposals on eucharistic presence, too, appear only in passing. More importantly, the book seems indeterminate in its treatment of the role of metaphysics in ecumenical theology. S. defends a need for metaphysics only by saying that metaphysics is unavoidable, and that any Christian metaphysics needs to be based on the biblical foundation of the distinction between creator and creation. The argument of the work seems to imply that transubstantiation is uniquely suited as a metaphysical explanation of eucharistic presence. Yet when this issue arises explicitly, S. seems only to ask that contemporary Protestants tolerate transubstantiation as the official Catholic theology of presence. George Hunsinger's theory of transelementation is mentioned positively but dismissively; post-metaphysical theories get even less traction. Is a shared metaphysics necessary for ecumenical agreement on the eucharist, including agreement on what is meant by "substance"?

This book is most valuable for its careful, ecumenically sensitive treatment of Thomas's theory of transubstantiation and a thoughtful appraisal of the core issues important to Luther and Calvin. It is suitable for undergraduates or lay Christians, and it would be especially helpful for Catholics, Lutherans, and Calvinists searching for a clearer understanding of the traditional Catholic understanding of eucharistic presence.

Kimberly Hope Belcher
University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN

Setting Captives Free: Personal Reflections on Ignatian Discernment of Spirits. By Timothy M. Gallagher, OMV. New York: Crossroad, 2018. Pp. xxxvii + 303. $24.95.

Fr. Gallagher has published nine volumes in Ignatian spirituality, including one entitled *Discernment of Spirits: An Ignatian Guide for Everyday Living.* The present book is based on that earlier publication, offering additional reflections about each of Ignatius's rules, and providing material from G.'s spiritual journals that illustrates them. Thus, *Setting Captives Free* does not offer the same kind of systematic treatment that one finds in the earlier volume (viii).

It needs to be said at the start that both of these volumes have misleading titles. The interested reader might order either of these books thinking that the author is offering a commentary on all of the Ignatian rules, that is, on the two sets, the first dealing primarily with spiritual desolation and the second treating mainly deceptive spiritual consolation. But each book comments only on the first set.

The author brings the same expert eye to Ignatius's rules that is in evidence in the previous work: knowledge of Ignatius's writings in the original, acquaintance with the

best traditional and contemporary interpretations, and a firm grasp of how the rules can guide the lives of 21st-century Christians.

To this reviewer's delight, it becomes clear early on that G.'s understanding of spiritual consolation and spiritual desolation places him among contemporary interpreters who constitute a minority, at least in the English language. He is rightly convinced that Ignatius always understands consolation and desolation as having their ordinary meanings: light, peaceful, joyful feelings on the one hand and heavy, dark, oppressive feelings on the other. He does not believe that "hard consolation" should enter the Ignatian vocabulary, both because the saint did not use the term and because it can be confusing. He recognizes that there are movements that are caused by the Holy Spirit, such as feelings of remorse, that do not fit in the category of spiritual consolation.

A persistent challenge for commentators on Ignatius' rules is how to understand Ignatius's use of the term "tears" in Rule 3 of the first set of rules: "I use the word 'consolation' when a person sheds tears which lead to the love of our Lord, whether these arise from grief over sins, or over the passion of our Lord." Unlike many commentators, G. takes the feeling accompanying the tears *in this context* to be sweet in quality, and not distressing or heavy, thus agreeing with Jules Toner, SJ (58).

Each of the fourteen rules in the first set of rules receives its own chapter, whose structure is uniform throughout the book. After offering his own translation of the rule, G. proceeds to interpret its meaning making use of older sources such as the early Directories as well as contemporary authors such as Toner and Daniel Gil, SJ. He then offers examples of laypersons, priests and religious whom the rule helped. At the end of each chapter he offers selections from his own spiritual journals, which cover thirty years of his life. The selections represent times when the rule under consideration came to his aid, either because he remembered it on his own or because his spiritual director called his attention to its relevance. G.'s examples are always pertinent and often not only mirror the rule but expand one's understanding of it.

The author does good work in carefully distinguishing between depression (an instance of non-spiritual desolation) and spiritual desolation, on the one hand, and spiritual desolation and the dark nights of the senses and of the spirit, on the other. He recognizes, as well, that depression can morph into spiritual desolation and experiences of dark night can be commingled with both depression and spiritual desolation. The dark night needs to be surrendered to, because it is God's work in the soul, while people experiencing spiritual desolation must act in ways that are contrary to the choices that that desolation is encouraging.

It becomes very clear in the course of this book that the author is a consistently discerning Christian. This is a great strength of the work even though it might lead some readers to feel that they cannot identify with his spiritual sensitivity and perceptiveness. In any case, the multitude of examples G. offers cannot help but clarify Ignatius's understanding of the rules.

Brian O. McDermott, SJ
Georgetown University, Washington, DC

THEOLOGICAL
Studies

Shorter Notices

Theological Studies
2020, Vol. 81(3) 767–774

DOI: 10.1177/0040563920963327
journals.sagepub.com/home/tsj
SAGE

T&T Clark Handbook of Edward Schillebeeckx. Edited by Stephan van Erp and Daniel Minch. New York: T&T Clark, 2020. Pp. xvi + 463. $149.43.

The editors of this comprehensive volume have provided Schillebeeckx scholars with a veritable library of resources. As they note in the introduction, there are now three generations of Schillebeeckx scholars, many of whom are represented here. There is a brief biographical introduction; the rest of the book is divided into four sections: Sources, Vatican II and its Aftermath, Theological Themes, and Theology of Culture, which deals with topics such as religious diversity and ecology that are not extensively treated by Schillebeeckx himself, but do draw on his related ideas. It is impossible to do full justice to this volume in a shorter note, but a few features are worth mentioning: the review of the historical and theological background of Schillebeeckx's theology from the 1930s to Vatican II; the use of sources in Dutch, German, and French in addition to English; detailed treatment of significant themes, such as the development of Schillebeeckx's hermeneutics; his reliance on scripture; critical theory; the resurrection; theological anthropology; and his efforts to navigate his relationship with the Vatican.

The first six chapters on "Sources" detail Schillebeeckx's reliance on philosophical and theological traditions in the years before Vatican II. His connection with Vatican II, which takes up the second section, includes analysis of his relationships with the Dutch bishops, and the move from sacramental theology to broader topics, as well as the investigations of this work by the Vatican. The third section covers more familiar territory, given the increased attention to Schillebeeckx's theology in recent years. The fourth section shows how Schillebeeckx's theology is relevant to current issues.

The chapters are well written, with copious notes, and largely accessible. There is much valuable information that those who do not read Dutch will appreciate. This is an essential text for any theological library.

Susan A. Ross
Loyola University Chicago

Discovering Pope Francis: The Roots of Jorge Mario Bergoglio's Thinking. Edited Brian Y. Lee and Thomas L. Knoebel. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical, 2019. Pp. 251. $23.49.

"To be faithful, to be creative, we need to be able to change. To change. . .so that [we] can adapt to the situations in which [we] must proclaim the Gospel." Thus is Pope Francis recorded saying in *The Church of Mercy*. It is something of an understatement to say that change has never come easily to the Catholic Church. *Discovering Pope Francis: The Roots of Jorge Mario Bergoglio's Thinking* offers an inside look into the development of the theological thought of the man who has generated much enthusiasm and hope in the American Church even as he has been met with growing dissent from within its conservative circles. This fine collection of essays, the fruits of a symposium on the pope held in Milwaukee in October 2018, seeks to re-introduce Francis to an American Church and society mired in increasing political and theological polarization. As Francis himself intimates in the book's forward, this work "brings to the English-speaking world the richness of the ideas of the men and women who influenced my own spiritual, theological and philosophical development" (xiii).

The book is divided into three main parts. After a short introductory chapter that recounts the story of the symposium, the book examines the Latin-American roots of Francis' formation and pastoral work, his emphasis on the church's evangelizing mission, and the impact of the theology of the people on his pastoral theology. The second part focuses on the influence of European theology on Francis, focusing especially on Romano Guardini, Henri de Lubac, Gaston Fessard, Luigi Giussani, and Hans Urs von Balthasar. The concluding section pivots back to the Americas by revisiting the theology of the people now from the perspective of the American Catholic Church (179).

While these eight chapters do not attempt to offer a direct assessment of the current papal ministry, they sketch a friendly, insightful and—to my knowledge—accurate intellectual biography of the Pope. The authors not only manage to stand above the polarizing fray but they also contribute to a better understanding of the Pope's history and theological perspective. I take issue with one author's uncritical reference to the "discovery" of the Americas (78) and with another's artificial pitting of the theology of the people against liberation theology (125). However, these are peripheral to heart of the book and need not prevent any potential reader from engaging this insightful volume.

Ernesto Valiente
Boston College

Everything Is Interconnected: Towards a Globalization with a Human Face and an Integral Ecology. Edited by Joseph Ogbonnaya and Lucas Briola. Lonergan Studies, International Institute for Method in Theology. Robert Doran and Joseph Ogbonnaya, general editors. Marquette Studies in Theology, no. 90. Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 2019. Pp. xxi + 271. $29.

This collection of fourteen essays examines connections between economic globalization and ecological responsibility. Addressing the issue from a variety of angles, the authors all operate to varying degrees within the influence of Robert M. Doran's interpretations of the work of Bernard J. F. Lonergan. The intention is to bring to bear this set of analytical tools, in dialogue with a variety of others, to address the global economy and its ecological impact in a holistic manner that breaks new ground and offers new possibilities.

For those already familiar with Doran's and Lonergan's work, the text can serve as a strong indicator of their applicability to contemporary world situations. In many cases the contributors' work sheds new technical light on issues that are lacking sufficient theological and/or philosophical analysis. Other chapters merely offer starting points for further consideration. As a result, the chapters may feel uneven to some readers, even when they contribute strong analyses or suggestive promise.

The text's utility will vary significantly with audience. For scholars operating within the Doran/Lonergan horizon, most of the analyses will appear almost intuitive, while offering platforms for further research. For those without the same presuppositions, the text will likely prove challenging. Still, given proper contextualization, several of the chapters could be used in graduate-level courses as examples of the application of systematic philosophical and theological analyses to contemporary issues.

Overall, the text is an opportunity for readers to see how a perspective some would consider an insular scholarly subset can address some of the most pressing issues of our day. The challenge lies in the hurdle presented by the systematic framework itself: while not all are convinced of the vitality of Lonergan's perspective, this collection of essays shows its flexibility, depth, and continued relevance, especially insofar as it is developed by Doran and those following in his footsteps.

Jeremy W. Blackwood
Sacred Heart Seminary and School of Theology, Hales Corner, WI

Walter Rauschenbusch: Essential Spiritual Writings. Selected with an introduction by Joseph J. Fahey. Modern Spiritual Masters Series. Maryknoll: Orbis, 2019. Pp. xl +104. $24.

Alongside Pope Leo XIII's 1891 encyclical *Rerum Novarum* and the respective writings on Catholic social ethics of John A. Ryan ("Right Reverend New Dealer") and Virgil Michel, OSB, I assign for my students a text by the Baptist minister and theologian Walter Rauschenbusch (1861–1918), who was a prominent proponent of the Social Gospel movement in the United States. I also tell them that if Oprah Winfrey were alive a century ago, Rauschenbusch's best-selling work might have been included in her book club. Yet, most of my students are unfamiliar with him and his contributions to social ethics, including his influence on Martin Luther King, Jr.; plus, much of his work is now difficult to obtain. I am therefore pleased that Joseph J. Fahey, who is

a retired professor of religious studies at Manhattan College and co-founder of Catholic Scholars for Worker Justice, has provided this concise collection of well-selected writings by Rauschenbusch.

Although it would not have occurred to me to focus on his—as the book's subtitle puts it—essential spiritual writings, Rauschenbusch's efforts indeed hinged on the synoptic gospels' message about Jesus's proclamation and inauguration of the kingdom of God, including as conveyed in the Lord's Prayer. As Fahey notes, while he was a pastor in Hell's Kitchen in New York City (1886–1897) Rauschenbusch was stirred by performing funerals for children and witnessing the economic exploitation of the poor by rich landlords and robber barons, as well as by a speech he attended by Fr. Edward McGlynn (1837–1900), which concluded with "Thy kingdom come. Thy will be done. . . ." In addition to the significance of that prayer and the kingdom of God, as observed in the selections included in this volume from his major as well as lesser known works, Rauschenbusch penned his own supplications for social justice, published in his 1910 book *For God and the People: Prayers of the Social Awakening*. Fahey is correct: "That message remains as fresh and urgently needed as it was one hundred years ago" (3).

Tobias Winright
Saint Louis University, St. Louis, MO

Imagining Jesus in His Own Culture. By Jerome H. Neyrey, SJ. Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2018. Pp.xiv+157. $37.90; $13.20.

This slim volume is at once challenging and fascinating. Steeped in *The Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatiu*s, and one of its primary forms of prayer, imaginative contemplation, Neyrey brings to Ignatian contemplation a lifetime of New Testament scholarship specializing in the relatively recently developed methodology of reading New Testament texts against anthropological understandings of the cultural context of Palestine at the time of Jesus under Roman rule. He invites the reader/pray-er to engage in visualizing and prayerfully interacting with Jesus precisely through richly textured descriptions of the daily life of peasants under Roman rule in the time of Jesus. By presenting thirty "cameos" relative to the stories, teachings, themes, and experiences of Jesus and his followers, N. introduces the reader/pray-er to the concrete realities of peasant life which yield challenging and accurate insights about the life of Jesus and his disciples and the teachings and experience of Jesus in this context. By so doing, he "corrects" misinterpretations of words, teachings, and the conditions and customs of daily life that contribute to contemporary misinterpretations and misunderstandings of the context which shaped Jesus's own worldview, life-experience, and experience of God.

This is essentially a prayer book. N. asks the reader to engage in placing oneself in the scene from Jesus's life being contemplated, guiding the process of "imagining Jesus" through these cameos which correct the reader's/pray-er's imagination and encounter with Jesus, based on his or her own cultural context and experience. For

anyone familiar with *The Spiritual Exercises*, without this richly described cultural experience of first century Palestinian peasant life, the reader/pray-er typically brings his or her own cultural context and understanding to the scriptural texts, and so has a different experience of Jesus than N. proposes. As a reviewer who is also a spiritual director, I wonder how pray-ers respond to these contemplations. And finally, the cultural context related to Jesus's life and teachings would also enrich and enliven preaching throughout the liturgical year.

Janet Ruffing, RSM
Yale Divinity School

Mysticism and Contemporary Life: Essays in Honor of Bernard McGinn. Edited by John J. Markey and J. August Higgins. New York: Herder and Herder, 2019. Pp. x + 283. $59.95.

The significance of Bernard McGinn's contributions to the contemporary study of Christian mysticism can hardly be overstated, and it is with deep gratitude that the contributors of this *Festschrift* continue his work of rendering the Western Christian mystical tradition more widely available to all religious seekers. A broad intended audience grants many of these essays a distinctly practical orientation: several essays explore the relevance of mystical insights for contemporary Christian contemplation, friendship, spiritual direction, and social justice. These more praxis-oriented essays are balanced by strongly theological contributions from the likes of David Tracy, Sandra M. Schneiders, and Mary Catherine Hilkert. As these authors argue, contemporary theology would benefit from the insights Christian mysticism affords into fundamental theology, theological anthropology, and religious experience. A wide range of mystical figures are discussed in these essays (e.g., Catherine of Siena, John of the Cross, Richard of St. Victor, Julian of Norwich, and Francis de Sales), which will be of niche interest to specialists. Additionally, some essays treat theoretical approaches to mysticism itself, engaging the thought of, among others, Michel de Certeau, Mircea Eliade, Raimon Panikkar, and Howard Thurman.

The diversity of topics and figures in this volume illustrate the many areas of scholarship in which contributions from Christian mysticism prove valuable, as well as witness to McGinn's own wide-ranging contributions, but it also means that the volume as a whole is something of a potpourri. A concluding essay that drew together strands of thought which overlapped across these essays would have been appreciated. The volume concludes with a bibliography of McGinn's works containing over 350 entries, an invaluable resource for all scholars of Christian mysticism. A testament to the ongoing relevance of McGinn's work for robust contemporary engagement with Christian mysticism, this volume testifies to the importance of Christian mysticism for doing theology that is relevant both to quotidian Christian life and to the deepest longings of the human heart.

Amy Maxey
University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN

Dying and the Virtues. By Matthew Levering. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2018. Pp. xi + 348. $45.

The Epistle to the Hebrews states that the Son became incarnate and died precisely in order to "deliver all those who through fear of death were subject to lifelong bondage" (2:15). The Christian thus faces a paradox: death is rightly feared and yet death has been conquered by Christ.

In *Dying and the Virtues*, Matthew Levering, a professor at Mundelein Seminary and author or editor of over fifty books, highlights nine virtues (love, hope, faith, penitence, gratitude, solidarity, humility, surrender, and courage) that should mark the journey from confronting the fear of annihilation, to reflecting on one's past and future, and, finally, to surrendering trustingly to God. His main points—death must be seen through the lens of Christ's own dying and rising, and death is a communal-ecclesial and not simply individual reality—are sound.

Two chapters exemplify L.'s method and insights. "Gratitude" weaves together the insights of the atheist physician Sherwin Nuland and Gregory of Nyssa's *Life of Saint Macrina*. Nuland's vision of death with dignity, L. argues, finds its fullness in Macrina's life of praise. Both Nuland and Macrina affirm the necessity of thanksgiving, but the former's retrospective glance at one's own achievements needs the latter's prospective hope in Christ's resurrection. "Courage" similarly explores the tensions between continuist (Plato, Qur'an, N.T. Wright, Richard Middleton) and discontinuist (Paul Griffiths) conceptions of the relationship between earthly and eternal life; L. holds that we need courage to let go of this present world and to embrace the unknown one to come.

The chief virtue of this book is its humility. L. generously lets others speak (occasionally at too great of a length) and irenically gleans whatever insights he can, even from sometimes problematic texts. It would have been good, though, to hear more of his own voice, perhaps in a concluding constructive proposal.

Intelligent, clear, and well documented (135 pages of notes for 169 pages of text), L.'s book is suitable for an advanced undergraduate or beginning graduate class on death or moral theology. Its comprehensive bibliography will be useful for students and teachers alike who seek to go deeper into the mystery of dying and rising in Christ.

Christopher Ruddy
The Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C.

Martyrs of Hope: Seven U.S. Missionaries in Central America. By Donna Whitson Brett and Edward T. Brett. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis, 2018. Pp. xxvi + 309. $25.

This book updates the histories of seven Roman Catholic men and women who died in Guatemala and El Salvador in the late 20th century: a diocesan priest, a religious brother, four religious sisters, and one laywoman. The murder of six of these readily fits a more modern definition of martyrdom. In the case of Sr. Carla Piette, MM, who

was killed in a tragic accident, the authors claim she may fit an expanded category of a "martyr of charity" advanced by Pope John Paul II. The most well-known cases described are those of the U.S. churchwomen killed in El Salvador in 1980. Recently Stanley Rother, a diocesan priest from Oklahoma, has garnered more attention because of his canonization process. Perhaps the least well-known is Christian Brother James Miller, whose case one of the authors became familiar with while teaching at the College of Santa Fe, run by the Christian Brothers, when Miller was killed. This project furthers the research of an earlier work by the two authors, *Murdered in Central America*, published by Orbis in 1988. This book updates that project, utilizing recent scholarship and updating the more recent history in each case.

Perhaps unique is the authors' ability to update the historical record for each of these cases with extensive use of letters and firsthand accounts. The update is effectively accomplished for Rother, Miller, and Piette. Those who are more familiar with the story of the U.S. churchwomen may leave wanting more in terms of the update on the current status of their judicial process and canonization process, and their impact on El Salvador today.

This book will interest anyone who wants to learn more about modern-day martyrs in Central America. It could easily be used in an undergraduate course on martyrdom, or for more advanced high school religion courses. The authors successfully describe the impact of these brave men and women while reminding the reader of the many native peoples in Guatemala and rural poor in El Salvador who also lost their lives during this time period.

John Thiede, SJ
Marquette University, Milwaukee, WI

Nihilism. By Nolen Gertz. The MIT Press Essential Knowledge Series. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 2019. Pp. vii + 209. $15.95.

In this book Gertz offers an argument about "why it matters that nothing matters." Contrary to expectations, this is not a sustained philosophical discussion of nihilism, but rather a critical-theory-style indictment of Western society that emphasizes its uncertainty, exhaustion, conformism, and detrimental entanglement with technology.

G.'s clearest definition of nihilism doesn't appear until chapter four: it is not about the rejection of meaningfulness, but "about evading reality rather than confronting it, about believing in other worlds rather than accepting this one. . ." (73). Thus, even idealists are judged as nihilists. Before this, there is a confusing introductory chapter claiming "nihilism" is often brandished as an unthinking accusation by the "self-righteous," followed by a breezy genealogy of nihilism traced through Socrates, Descartes (!), Hume, Kant (responsible for "existential nihilism"), and leading inevitably to Nietzsche. The third chapter differentiates nihilism from pessimism, cynicism, and apathy, making the stunning claim that optimism, if it makes us complacent, "leads us to do nothing" and is "similar to nihilism" (64).

The argument picks up steam and coherence at the book's mid-point: nihilism is not really an individual's lack of moral beliefs, but rather a social and cultural structure that can only be addressed by politics. Along with Nietzsche (whose specter looms over the book), G. relies on de Beauvoir (absent external authority, the "serious" person judges all to be meaningless), Arendt (faith in bureaucracy and science leads to nihilism and disaster), and Heidegger and Ellul on technology (technology, framing all contemporary reality, usurps human agency) to conclude that "the dreams of the Enlightenment" are actually "nightmares from which we need to wake up before it's too late" (186). Instead of a constructive conclusion, G. offers only the hope that our nihilistic systems "will make us just destructive enough to force us to finally become creative" (186).

Religious belief barely makes an appearance here; when it does, it is labeled an escape from reality. Also problematic is G.'s binary judgment: to admit uncertainty (e.g. Socrates, Descartes) is tantamount to being a nihilist. Although G. eventually presents an argument worth making, better cultural diagnoses can be found in Byung-Chul Han's *The Transparency Society*, and better alternatives in Pope Francis' *Laudato Si'*.

Anthony J. Godzieba
Villanova University, Philadelphia

THEOLOGICAL
Studies

Books Received

Theological Studies
2020, Vol. 81(3) 775–778

DOI: 10.1177/0040563920963331
journals.sagepub.com/home/tsj
SAGE

Scriptural Studies

Bond, Helen K. *The First Biography of Jesus: Genre and Meaning in Mark's Gospel*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. Pp. 360. $42.99.

Boring, Eugene M. *Hearing Paul's Voice: Insights for Teaching and Preaching*. Foreword by Thomas G. Long. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. Pp. 256. $29.99.

Cassidy, Richard J. *A Roman Commentary on St. Paul's Letter to the Philippians*. New York: Crossroad, 2020. Pp. viii + 219. $89.95.

Imperato, Robert. *Portraits of Jesus: A Reading Guide*. 3rd ed. London: Rowman and Littlefield, 2020. Pp. viii + 91. $22.99.

Johnson, Luke Timothy. *Constructing Paul*. The Canonical Paul, Vol. 1. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. Pp. xiv + 385. $50.

van Wijk-Bos, Johanna W.H. *The Road to Kingship: 1-2 Samuel*. A People and a Land, Vol. 2. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing, 2020. Pp. xiv + 413. $29.99.

Historical

Bernauer, SJ, James. *Jesuit Kaddish: Jesuits, Jews, and Holocaust Remembrance*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. xxx + 187. $55.

Clayton, Lawrence, and David Lantigua, eds. *Bartolomé de las Casas and the Defense of Amerindian Rights*. Tuscaloosa, AL: University of Alabama Press, 2020. Pp. 160. $29.95.

Clements, Niki Kasumi. *Sites of the Ascetic Self: John Cassian and Christian Ethical Formation*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. xi + 280. $65.

González, Justo L. *Teach Us to Pray: The Lord's Prayer in the Early Church and Today*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. Pp. vi + 185. $16.99.

Lee, James K. *The Church in the Latin Fathers*. Lanham, MD: Fortress Academic, 2020. Pp. 137. $90.

Lindsay, Mark R. *God Has Chosen: The Doctrine of Election Throughout Christian History*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2020. Pp. 384. $30.

Ochs, Vanessa L. *The Passover Haggadah: A Biography*. Lives of Great Religious Books. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2020. Pp. 214. $26.95.

Seubert, Xavier, and Oleg Bychkov, eds. *Aesthetic Theology in the Franciscan Tradition: The Senses and the Experience of God in Art*. Routledge Research in Art and Religion. New York: Routledge, 2020. Pp. xiv + 394. $150.

Fundamental and Systematic

Craig, William Lane. *Atonement and the Death of Christ*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2020. Pp. ix + 318. $24.95.

Dorrien, Gary. *In a Post-Hegelian Spirit*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2020. Pp. xvii + 621. $79.95.

Faggioli, Massimo. *The Liminal Papacy of Pope Francis: Moving toward Global Catholicity*. Foreword Ilia Delio. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2020. Pp. 224. $27.

Grummett, David, ed. *Henri de Lubac and the Shaping of Modern Theology: A Reader*. San Francisco, CA: Ignatius, 2020. Pp. 404. $21.21.

Hart, David Bentley. *Theological Territories*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. xix + 393. $29.

Hooton, Peter. *Bonhoeffer's Religionless Christianity in its Christological Context*. New York: T&T Clark, 2020. Pp. ix + 211. $95.

de Jouvancy, SJ, Joseph. *The Way to Learn and the Way to Teach*. Eds. Cristiano Casalini and Claude Pavur, SJ. Chestnut Hill, MA: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2020. Pp. 270. $39.95.

Madar, Martin. *The Church of God and Its Human Face: The Contribution of Joseph A. Komonchak to Ecclesiology.* Eugene, OR: Pickwick, 2019. Pp. xviii + 199. $21.60.

McGrath, Alister. *Iustitia Dei*. 4th ed. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2020. Pp. xvi + 500. $44.99.

McInerny, Brendan. *The Trinitarian Theology of Hans Urs von Balthasar*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. 248. $55.

Pidel, SJ, Aaron. *The Church of the Ever Greater God: The Ecclesiology of Erich Przywara*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. xv + 306. $60.

Romero, Óscar. *Saint Óscar Romero: Voice of the Voiceless. The Four Pastoral Letters and Other Statements*. Trans. Michael J. Walsh. Introduction Michael E. Lee. Reflections Jon Sobrino and Ignacio Martín-Baró. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2020. Pp. xv + 223. $28.

Comparative and Interreligious

Bir, Ellen. *Embracing the Inconceivable: Interspiritual Practice of Zen and Christianity*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2020. Pp. xii + 204. $24.

Brown, Joshua R. *Balthasar in Light of Early Confucianism*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. xvi + 301. $55.

Mayfield, Tyler. *Unto Us a Child is Born: Isaiah, Advent, and our Jewish Neighbors*. Foreword Walter Brueggemann. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. Pp. 200. $19.99.

Omar, Irfan and Kaitlyn Daly, eds. *Interfaith Engagement in Milwaukee*. Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 2020. Pp. 376. $32.

Panikkar, Raimon. *Trinitarian and Cosmotheandric Vision*. Ed. Milena Carrara Pavan. Opera Omnia, Vol. 3. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2019. Pp. xv + 253. $90.

Petrusek, Matthew and Jonathan Rothchild. *Value and Vulnerability: An Interfaith Dialogue on Human Dignity*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. ix + 500. $150.

Reynolds, Gabriel Said. *Allah: God in the Qur'an*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2020. Pp. x + 327. $30.

Slater, Michael R, Erin M. Cline and Philip J. Ivanhoe, eds. *Confucianism and Catholicism: Reinvigorating the Dialogu*e. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. xxiii + 246. $65.

Moral Theology and Ethics

Camp, Lee C. *Scandalous Witness: A Little Political Manifesto for Christians*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing, 2020. Pp. viii + 183. $19.99.

Castillo, Daniel P. *An Ecological Theology of Liberation: Salvation and Political Ecology*. Foreword Gustavo Gutiérrez. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Press, 2019. Pp. xxviii + 227. $40.

Doak, Mary. *A Prophetic Public Church: Witness to Hope amid the Global Crises of the 21st Century*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Academic, 2020. Pp. xxi + 234. $29.95.

Eggemeier, Matthew and Peter Joseph Fritz. *The Politics of Mercy: Catholic Life in an Era of Inequality, Racism, and Violence*. New York: Herder & Herder, 2020. Pp. 200. $49.95.

King, Jason and Julie Hanlon Rubio, eds. *Sex, Love and Families: Catholic Perspectives*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Academic, 2020. Pp. 328. $34.95.

Mescher, Marcus. *The Ethics of Encounter: Christian Neighbor Love as a Practice of Solidarity*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2020. Pp. 240. $28.49.

Liturgical, Spiritual, and Pastoral

Barrett, OSB, Mark. *The Wind, the Fountain, and the Fire: Scripture and the Renewal of the Christian Imagination*. The 2020 Lent Book. London: Bloomsbury, 2019. Pp. 181. $15.

Brunk, Timothy. *The Sacraments and Consumer Culture*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Academic, 2020. Pp. xv + 212. $24. 95.

Pope Francis. *The Gospel of Matthew: A Spiritual and Pastoral Reading.* Foreword Daniel P. Horan, OFM. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2020. Pp. xiii + 257. $22.

Lohfink, Gerhard. *Prayer Takes Us Home: The Theology and Practice of Christian Prayer*. Trans. Linda M. Maloney. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Academic, 2020. Pp. xi + 209. $24.95.

McGann, Mary. *The Meal That Reconnects: Eucharistic Eating and the Global Food Crisis*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Academic, 2020. Pp. 256. $29.95.

Moloney, SDB, Francis. *Reading Revelation at Easter Time*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Academic, 2020. Pp. 224. $24.95.

Moschella, Mary Clark and Lee H. Butler, Jr., eds. *The Edward Wimberly Reader: A Black Pastoral Theology*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2020. Pp. x + 298. $54.95.

O'Keefe, Theresa A. *Navigating Toward Adulthood: A Theology of Ministry with Adolescents*. New York: Paulist, 2018. Pp. xi + 172. $29.95.

Piccione, Joseph J. *Receiving God and Responding, in Breath Meditation*. New York: Crossroad, 2020. Pp. 112. $29.95.

Wong, Joseph H. and Harvey D. Egan. *The Christology and Mystical Theology of Karl Rahner*. Foreword Leo J. O'Donovan. New York: Crossroad, 2020. Pp. xiv + 219. $39.95.

Philosophy, Science, and Other

Condic, Maureen L. *Untangling Twinning: What Science Tells Us About the Nature of Human Embryos*. Notre Dame Studies in Medical Ethics and Bioethics. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2020. Pp. xv + 178. $145.

Copan, Paul. *Loving Wisdom: A Guide to Philosophy and Christian Faith*. 2nd ed. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. Pp. 376. $29.99.

Cortright, David, ed. *Truth Seekers: Voices of Truth and Nonviolence from Gandhi to Pope Francis*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2020. Pp. xviii + 254. $30.

Ecklund, Elaine Howard. *Why Science and Faith Need Each Other: Eight Shared Values that Move us Beyond Fear*. Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos, 2020. Pp. 176. $17.99.

Haden, Kyle Edward. *Embodied Idolatry: A Critique of Christian Nationalism*. Lanham, MD: Lexington, 2020. Pp. 174. $90.

Hudson, Hud. *A Grotesque in the Garden*. 2nd ed. Foreword Michael Rea. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. Pp. 200. $16.99.

Newson, Ryan Andrew. *Cut in Stone: Confederate Monuments and Theological Disruptions*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2020. Pp. xvi + 224. $34.95.

Oliver, Michael. *Deconstructing Undecidability*. Lanham, MD: Fortress Academic. Pp. 256. $95.

Waters, Kerry, ed. *Let Justice Be Done: Writings from American Abolitionists 1688–1865*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2020. Pp. 208. $22.